

## **MINUTES OF COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE MEETING**

### **PERRYSBURG CITY COUNCIL**

**FEBRUARY 5, 2018**

President of Council Jim Matuszak called the meeting to order at 5:30 p.m. Present were Council Members Deborah Born, Haraz N. Ghanbari, Jim Matuszak, Tim McCarthy, Jonathan Smith, Barry VanHoozen, and Becky Williams (7). Also present were Bridgette Kabat, City Administrator, Karlene Henderson, Law Director, and David Creps, Clerk of Council.

The purpose of the meeting was to hear a presentation regarding the plans for a proposed second fire station on Fort Meigs Road. Fire Chief Rudy Ruiz used a PowerPoint presentation to show a 34% increase in call volumes over the last ten years. He reviewed the Strategic Plan that was prepared utilizing internal and external stakeholders. He said that it was determined that they do not need to double the number of apparatus, they can be split between the two stations. Chief Ruiz said that if nine firefighters are on duty they will have five at the Fort Meigs station and four at the Indiana Avenue station. If eight are on duty it will be split evenly, and if seven are on duty there will be four at the Fort Meigs station and three at the Indiana Avenue station. Chief Ruiz said that in the future we will probably have to hire one more firefighter per shift. He said that the two stations will allow them to cover most of the City within a five minute response time. Chief Ruiz showed the layout of the proposed station. He said that it will provide a second site for the Emergency Operations Center (EOC). They will also be able to do training onsite that they are currently doing offsite. The station will have four apparatus bays, seven bunks and three restrooms. Chief Ruiz said that it will be a cancer prevention facility and he explained the zones that separate the living quarters from the turnout gear.

Ray Micham of The Collaborative showed the elevations of the fire station. He said that they got input from the people who will be using the building. He said that it is consistent with the municipal complex. However, they will not close specific products when they go out to bid.

Al Ziemkiewicz and Karen Karl of Lathrop presented information regarding the cost of the project. They showed the cost of several recent projects they have been involved with across the country. The total construction estimate is \$8,172,450 or \$370.55 per square foot. The total project estimate is \$9,820,811 which is \$445.29 per square foot. Ms. Kabat said that the project will be funded by a combination of cash and either bond anticipation notes or long term debt. She said that there are two philosophies when considering whether to go with short term or long term debt. She said that she believes the Finance Director would recommend short term notes and to pay it off as soon as possible. However, there is another philosophy that long term bonds should be used so the people who are benefitting from the fire station pay for it. Ms. Kabat said that the three requests from the Administration are to proceed with the balance of Lathrop's contract, permission to go out to bid, and to provide guidance regarding funding for the budget amendment. She added that legislation for the first two items are on the agenda for the City Council meeting the following evening.

There was a break in the meeting from 6:08 p.m. to 6:15 p.m.

Ms. Williams asked Chief Ruiz about the additional staff he had mentioned. Chief Ruiz said that it is a part of the City growing and they are utilizing part-time firefighters to fill the gaps, but they don't have a lot of them. He said that as they begin to see more back to back calls he feels they will need the additional staff. There was additional discussion regarding staffing and the allocation per station.

Mr. Matuszak said that the presentation shows that there will always be more staffing at the Fort Meigs Station. He asked if that was based on call volume. Chief Ruiz said that there will be more room at the Fort Meigs station, and he can see the Fort Meigs station being headquarters and the Indiana Avenue station being a satellite station.

Mr. McCarthy asked Ms. Kabat if the \$9.89 million total cost includes the \$2.1 million that has been set aside. Ms. Kabat said that is included in the \$9.89 million. She said there has been \$1.6 million encumbered and approximately \$375,000 expended.

Mr. Matuszak asked what is included in the 5% construction contingency line item. Ms. Karl said that it is the \$6.6 million in direct costs. Ms. Kabat noted that the contingency line item is not an automatic expenditure. Mr. Matuszak asked about the ordinance for Lathrop that would be considered at the City Council meeting the following night. Ms. Kabat said that it is the balance of the contract for Lathrop for the construction management portion. Ms. Kabat said that once they get permission to go to bid, construction management comes into play. She said that they will be evaluating the bids to find the lowest, best, most responsive bid and will be bringing it back to City Council.

Mr. Matuszak asked if the apparatus bay are one or two deep. Chief Ruiz said that apparatus could be stacked, but they want to drive through for safety reasons. Mr. Matuszak asked if we are overbuilding the apparatus bay. Chief Ruiz said that they will also use it as a training area. Mr. Ghanbari said that we may need the additional space in the future for apparatus, and he looks at it as a long term investment. Mr. Matuszak said that he understands looking into the future and that we will have growth, but the answer may be building a third station, not overbuilding the second one. Ms. Kabat said that the apparatus bay is the cheapest square footage to build. Mr. Matuszak asked if the mezzanine could be eliminated. Ms. Kabat said that they would have to find room on the first floor for the mechanicals. Mr. Matuszak asked about the size of the training/EOC room. Chief Ruiz said there is seating for fifty. Mr. Matuszak asked when they would use it. Chief Ruiz said that they could use it for public training, national and international speakers, National Fire Academy events, and Regional Fire Academy events. Ms. Kabat said that it can be used for CPR training and it will be a back-up EOC to house elected officials and the media. Ms. Williams asked the square footage of the training/EOC room. Mr. Micham said that he believes it is around 1,000 square feet. Mr. Matuszak asked if firefighters are required to maintain a certain level of fitness because he's concerned the fitness center won't be used. Chief Ruiz said that fire stations all across the country have fitness centers and the current one is always being used. He said that shifts use it together and it builds camaraderie. Mr. Matuszak asked if the warm zone is used after all calls. Chief Ruiz said that it is used after fires or medic runs with a lot of bodily fluids. Ms. Kabat added that the State of Ohio requires a hardened area for a storm shelter to hold twenty people for two hours which will be in the area of the warm zone. Mr. Matuszak asked if our Code requires 32 public parking spaces. Mr. Micham said that the Planning & Zoning Code doesn't require a certain number of parking spaces for this type of building, the number of parking spaces shown is based on the staffing and training room. There was discussion about the type of roof and Ms. Kabat said they looked at a standing seam roof instead of shingles. Ms. Karl said that the price of shingles is \$11 per square foot versus \$20 per square foot for the standing seam roof. Mr. Matuszak asked if the life expectancy of a metal roof is double that of shingles. Ms. Karl said that she does not know.

Mr. Matuszak stated that the cost of Maumee's fire station built several years ago would have been \$370 per square foot at today's dollar. Ms. Kabat said that we don't know what went into that \$6.2 million dollar cost, does it include land, testing, etc. Mr. Smith asked if there is any chance we could do more of a rectangular shaped building and get rid of some of the dead space. Ms. Kabat said that they

would have to look into it because our Planning and Zoning Code has certain requirements about variations. Ms. Born asked about using Green Leads materials in the building. Mr. Micham said that the majority of the design is comparable to Leads. It is low energy, low maintenance, well insulated. In his opinion they could not find any additional ways to be efficient to save money, but they could find some ways but it would cost more. Ms. Born said that fire stations are supposed to last 75 years. Mr. Micham said that techniques that are consistent with Leads are integrated in this building. He thinks this is the right mix for this application. Mr. VanHoozen said that he went through the fire operations training that showed how difficult their work is so he agrees the fitness center is needed. He asked what other stations we learned from to design this station. Chief Ruiz said that they visited local stations including Sylvania, Perrysburg Township, and Dayton. They looked for ease of use and went to a new fire station conference in Texas which is where they learned about the hot and warm zones. Mr. VanHoozen said that the square footage for direct costs is not out of where it should be, and the 20,000 square feet for the building allows us to expand in the future. Chief Ruiz said that they have a little bit of leeway because they have bunks for seven, and he does not see the need to add any specialty apparatus. He added that if the City continues to grow to the south, we may need a third station.

Deborah Born read the following statement “the standard practice for cities our size (20,000) people is to have four fire stations, and we have one. In addition, our one fire station is cut off from a large portion of the City on the west side by a heavily used train track. A lengthy train could waste valuable minutes if it blocks the road for fire trucks. The City will continue to grow on the west side, which makes the need even greater as growth continues. I believe the most cost efficient way to fund the construction is by issuing long term bonds since the City of Perrysburg has a very good credit rating.”

Ms. Williams said that at the beginning of the process she thought the estimate would be under \$10 million dollars and we’re there. She said that they have made cuts and she is satisfied with the answers she’s gotten.

Jim Hagen, 10741 Avenue Road, recommended looking at solar panels to see if it would save money. He also recommended going with a metal roof because it will last longer and the materials are completely recyclable. He also said that they should make sure that there are separate air intakes from the apparatus bays because at the Department of Public Service building when they run trucks in the service bays, they get fumes in the office area. Mr. Hagen asked if furnishings are included in the overall cost, and Ms. Kabat said that they are. Ms. Williams asked if solar panels are feasible. Mr. Micham said that they did not do a solar study on this project, but generally you will not save enough to cover the cost of the panels. He said that usually grants are needed but they typically are not for tax exempt organizations. He said that when solar is used, there is usually a motivated customer who is willing to pay extra. He said that they have optimized energy efficiency in this building but they attacked it on the reduction side.

Chris Finkbeiner, West River Road, said that he looked at an article in the Blade two years ago and it estimated the cost of the building at \$3.5 million dollars. He said there is a lot of infrastructure needs in the City and he hopes City Council will look at the cost. He said that he does not question the need for another fire station.

Mr. Matuszak said that his questions are not because he is opposed to a second fire station, but the cost seems high and he wants to make sure we don’t spend more than we need to spend. He thanked the Fire Division for the job they do.

## **ADJOURNMENT**

Mr. Smith moved to adjourn the meeting at 8:06 p.m. Seconded by Ms. Williams.  
Ayes: (7). Nays: (0).

David D. Creps, Clerk

Thomas G. Mackin, Mayor